UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

Hon. Noel L. Hillman

Civil No. 07-2867 (NLH/AMD)

MDL Docket No. 1850

IN RE: PET FOOD PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

DEFENDANTS' RESPONSE IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF PROPOSED SETTLEMENT

Hearing Date: October 14, 2008

Hearing Time: 9:30 a.m.

Judge:

Hon. Noel L. Hillman

Defendants Menu Foods Income Fund, Nestlé Purina PetCare Company, Wal-Mart

Stores, Inc., PETCO Animal Supplies, Inc., PETCO Animal Supplies Stores, Inc., PetSmart, Inc.,

Kroger Co., Kroger Supermarkets, Inc., Target Corporation, Hill's Pet Nutrition, Inc., The Iams

Company, Del Monte Foods, Co., Mars, Incorporated, Nutro Products, Inc., Royal Canin,

U.S.A., Inc., ChemNutra Inc., ChemNutra LLC, and Wilbur-Ellis Company, by and through

Liaison Counsel for Defendants, submit this Response in Support of Motion for Final Approval

of Proposed Settlement. Because the proposed Settlement is fair, reasonable, and adequate and

meets the requirements for final approval under Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e), Defendants respectfully

submit that this Court should grant final approval of the proposed Settlement.

By: /s authorized for ECF filing

Mary E. Gately, Esq. DLA PIPER US LLP 500 Eighth Street, NW

Washington, DC 20004

Telephone: (202) 799-4000 Facsimile: (202) 799-5000 mary.gately@dlapiper.com

Counsel for the Menu Foods Defendants and

Liaison Counsel for Defendants

By: /s authorized for ECF filing

Craig A. Hoover, Esq.

HOGAN & HARTSON LLP

Columbia Square

555 Thirteenth Street, NW

Washington, D.C. 20004-1109

Telephone: (202) 637-5600 Facsimile: (202) 637-5910

cahoover@hhlaw.com

Counsel for Nestlé Purina PetCare Company

and Liaison Counsel for Defendants

By: /s authorized for ECF filing

D. Jeffrey Ireland, Esq.

FARUKI, IRELAND & COX, P.L.L.

500 Courthouse Plaza, S.W.

10 North Ludlow Street

Dayton, OH 45402

Telephone: (937) 227-3710 Facsimile: (937) 227-3749

djireland@ficlaw.com

Counsel for the Iams Company and Liaison Counsel for Defendants

By: /s authorized for ECF filing

Mark C. Goodman, Esq.

SQUIRE, SANDERS & DEMPSEY L.L.P.

One Maritime Plaza, Suite 300 San Francisco, CA 94111-3492

Telephone: (415) 954-0289 Facsimile: (415) 393-9887

mgoodman@ssd.com

Counsel for PETCO Animal Supplies, Inc., PETCO Southwest, Inc., PETCO Animal Supplies Stores, Inc., PetSmart, Inc., Target Corp., Wal-Mart Stores, Inc., and Wal-Mart, Inc. and Liaison Counsel for Defendants

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this Haday of October 2008 a true and correct copy of the foregoing was served on all parties via the UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT ELECTRONIC FILING SERVICE.